Review: several interventions prevent ventilator associated pneumonia in critically ill patients


**QUESTION:** Which interventions prevent ventilator associated pneumonia (VAP) in critically ill patients?

### Data sources

English language studies were identified by searching Medline (1966–2001) and the Cochrane Library, and by reviewing bibliographies of retrieved articles.

### Study selection

Studies were selected if they were randomised controlled trials (RCTs) or observational cohort controlled trials.

### Data extraction

Data were extracted on study design, intervention, and outcomes.

---

### Effectiveness of interventions for preventing ventilator associated pneumonia (VAP) in critically ill patients

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Intervention</th>
<th>Results</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Semirecumbent vs supine positioning† (3 trials, n=116)</td>
<td>↓ VAP (1 RCT, n=86); ↓ gastroesophageal reflux and aspiration events (2 controlled clinical trials, n=32); no difference in mortality (1 RCT, n=86)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stress ulcer prophylaxis: sucralfate or H(_2) antagonists (7 MAs of &gt;20 RCTs; 1 recent RCT, n=1200)</td>
<td>↓ VAP (4 of 7 MAs); 3 MAs found no difference; ↓ mortality (3 of 4 MAs); equivocal evidence regarding increased gastrointestinal bleeding (2 MAs); 1 recent RCT (n=1200) found increased bleeding</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aspiration of subglottic secretions vs none† (3 RCTs, n=641)</td>
<td>no difference in VAP (2 RCTs, n=486); reduced VAP (1 RCT, n=145), delayed time to VAP development (3 RCTs, n=641); no difference in mortality (3 RCTs, n=641)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oscillating vs standard non-oscillating beds† (1 MA of 6 RCTs; 1 recent RCT, n=103)</td>
<td>↓ pneumonia (1 MA), no difference (1 RCT, n=103); no difference in mortality (1 MA, 1 RCT, n=103)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Selective digestive tract decontamination vs none† (7 MAs of &gt;40 RCTs)</td>
<td>↓ VAP (7 MAs); ↓ mortality (4 of 7 MAs)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Topical + systemic antibiotics vs none†</td>
<td>↓ VAP (3 of 3 MAs); ↓ mortality (4 of 4 MAs)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Topical antibiotics alone vs none†</td>
<td>↓ VAP (3 of 3 MAs); no difference in mortality (4 of 4 MAs)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ventilator circuit management (4 RCTs, n=NA)</td>
<td>no difference in VAP (4 RCTs)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fewer v more changes (4 RCTs)</td>
<td>no difference in VAP (4 RCTs)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fewer v more changes in heat and moisture exchangers (1 RCT)</td>
<td>no difference in VAP (1 RCT)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Heat and moisture exchanger v humidifier (1 MA of 5 RCTs)</td>
<td>no difference in VAP (4 of 5 RCTs in 1 MA); no difference in mortality (4 of 4 RCTs in 1 MA)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enteral feeding methods (4 RCTs, n=604)</td>
<td>no difference in VAP or mortality (1 RCT, n=44)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Small intestinal v gastric feeding</td>
<td>no difference in VAP or mortality (1 RCT, n=44)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Metoclopramide v none†</td>
<td>no difference in VAP or mortality (1 RCT, n=305)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acidified v normal feeding†</td>
<td>no difference in VAP or mortality (1 RCT, n=95)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intermittent v continuous feeding</td>
<td>no difference in VAP or mortality (1 RCT, n=60)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*RCT = randomised controlled trial, MA = meta-analysis, NA = not available.
†Information on comparison group provided by author.

---

### Comments

VAP is a common condition among critically ill patients and a burden to healthcare systems. Although the incidence of VAP is difficult to determine because of diagnostic variability, research shows a 20–30% mortality rate, longer ICU and hospital stays, and higher hospital costs for patients with VAP.

The systematic review by Collard et al provides a thorough analysis of the evidence to date, highlighting the considerable gaps in our knowledge. In selecting studies for inclusion, the authors noted the lack of standardised diagnostic criteria, which prevented pooling of individual study results in a meta-analysis. Diagnostic criteria for VAP may include fever, leukocytosis, purulent secretions, and changes on chest radiography and microbiology. Limitations of existing studies included small sample sizes, lack of power, and equivocal and conflicting findings.

Although semirecumbent positioning of all eligible patients appears easy, inexpensive, and relatively uncontroversial, evidence on practices such as oscillation beds and selective digestive decontamination is equivocal. Collard et al correctly attributed these conflicting findings to differences in inclusion criteria, outcome measures, and analyses used in individual studies. They also caution practitioners about the use of selective digestive tract decontamination because of uncertainties about effects of such treatment on antibiotic resistance, although no additional evidence to support this was included in the review.

Although cost may be a barrier for many of these practices, it is important to educate clinicians to take measures to prevent and recognise symptoms, and diagnose VAP. Collard et al also noted that to date, no RCT has evaluated the effectiveness of combined preventative practices. Given the high mortality rate associated with VAP, this research should be a priority.

Tracey Bucknall, RN, PhD
Associate Professor, Faculty of Medicine, Dentistry and Health Sciences
University of Melbourne, Carlton, Victoria, Australia

Review: several interventions prevent ventilator associated pneumonia in critically ill patients

*Evid Based Nurs* 2003 6: 112
doi: 10.1136/ebn.6.4.112

Updated information and services can be found at:
http://ebn.bmj.com/content/6/4/112

These include:

**References**
This article cites 3 articles, 0 of which you can access for free at:
http://ebn.bmj.com/content/6/4/112#BIBL

**Email alerting service**
Receive free email alerts when new articles cite this article. Sign up in the box at the top right corner of the online article.

**Topic Collections**
Articles on similar topics can be found in the following collections

- Pneumonia (infectious disease) (52)
- Pneumonia (respiratory medicine) (44)
- TB and other respiratory infections (122)
- Adult intensive care (101)
- Clinical diagnostic tests (109)
- Drugs: infectious diseases (241)
- Internet (387)

**Notes**

To request permissions go to:
http://group.bmj.com/group/rights-licensing/permissions

To order reprints go to:
http://journals.bmj.com/cgi/reprintform

To subscribe to BMJ go to:
http://group.bmj.com/subscribe/